

UNCLASSIFIED

384

ENCLOSURE (A)

INT 41

[Subject] Comments of the Department of the Navy on the
Report to the National Security Council entitled
"The Central Intelligence Agency and National
Organization for Intelligence" dated 1 January 1949.

1. The following comments and recommendations regarding the
subject report are submitted by the Office of Naval Intelligence.
The report contained herein is confined to those "Conclusions and
Recommendations" contained in the subject report which are of
concern to the Department of the Navy.

2. The majority of the "Conclusions and Recommendations"
contained in the subject report may be catalogued under the
following headings of which the first covers practically the
entire report:

- A. Coordination
- B. The Intelligence Advisory Committee
- C. The Interdepartmental Coordinating and Planning Staff
- D. The Central Intelligence Agency
- E. Miscellaneous, which includes such matters as personnel,
crisis estimates, and intelligence agencies other than
the CIA.

The following comments and recommendations will be placed in the
foregoing categories.

ENCLOSURE (A)

COPY

30/20

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480/

A. Coordination

The report states that the coordination function of the CIA is not being adequately exercised and that (page 3) "what is needed in continuing and effective coordinating action under existing directives and also directives establishing more precisely the responsibility of the various intelligence agencies." The report also states that (page 5) "coordination can most effectively be achieved by mutual agreement among the various agencies." The National Security Act of 1947 charges the Director of the CIA with recommending to the National Security Council measures for coordination of the intelligence agencies but confers upon the Director no authority over those agencies. As each of those agencies is under its own Departmental Head, such authority would be inconsistent with normal command relations. Consequently, the best organization for effectively establishing the desired degree of coordination appears to be the Intelligence Advisory Committee. The IAC will be dealt with in more detail in the next section of this report, but it is believed that the authority and responsibilities of the IAC could be broadened without conflict with the National Security Act of 1947 and thus enable this Committee to accomplish more effective coordination in the field of intelligence requirements. Among the essentials necessary to achieve

ENCLOSURE 1

4 of 20

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 48

proper coordination the subject report lists (page 54) "continuous examination on the initiative of the CIA of instances of duplication and failure of coordination; directives which establish more precisely the responsibilities of the various departments and the effective carrying out of plans through close interdepartmental consultation at all levels." Although the IAC has no authority at present to issue coordinating directives, it can be authorized to recommend such directives to the NSC. The other essentials listed above appear to be functions which the IAC could most effectively perform.

B. The Intelligence Advisory Committee

The subject report states that (page 63) "the Intelligence Advisory Committee is soundly conceived, but it should participate more actively with the Director of Central Intelligence in the continuing coordination of intelligence activation." It is also further stated in the discussion of National Intelligence Estimates that (page 81) "these estimates should be submitted for discussion and approval by the reconstituted Intelligence Advisory Committee whose members should assume collective responsibility for them." The Chief of Naval Intelligence questions the statement that "the IAC is soundly conceived. The present NSCID No. 1 establishes the IAC "to advise the Director of Central Intelligence". This statement and the

ENCLOSURE A/

50/9

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 41

name of the Committee are indicative that its functions are purely advisory and that it is without authority.

In the matter of making recommendations to and advising the ESC these recommendations and this advice originate with the Director of the CIA who indicated the concurrence or nonconcurrence of the IAC members. There is no requirement that recommendations or advice which originate with members of the IAC be forwarded to the Council unless the Director of CIA sees fit to do so. It is believed that recommendations or advice which originates with a member of the IAC should be forwarded to the Council whether the Director of CIA agrees or not.

Directives issued in implementation of National Security Council Directives are now issued by the Director of the CIA after unanimous concurrence by the IAC. This procedure could be strengthened as will be indicated later in this paragraph.

The second quotation above states that the IAC members "should assume collective responsibility" for National Intelligence Estimates. It is submitted that if the IAC members are to assume "collective responsibility" they should be assigned collective authority.

ENCLOSURE

6 of 8

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 4

rather than a collective advisory capacity, in the production of these estimates.

In order to effect the improvements indicated in the subject report and to overcome the defects in the charter of the IAC, it is recommended that the present HSCID No. 1 be reissued along the lines indicated in the proposed redraft attached and labelled Enclosure (B). This proposal would change the name of the Committee to "Intelligence Coordinating Committee". None of the changes indicated usurp any of the authority delegated to the Director of the CIA by the National Security Act of 1947. All changes are intended to strengthen the coordinating machinery of the governmental intelligence agencies.

C. The Interdepartmental Coordinating and Planning Staff

The subject report makes a number of comments regarding ICAPS, many of which are organizational in character within CIA. The report states that it should be reconstituted and suggests the name of "Coordination Division". The report further states that its assigned mission, which it has failed to execute, (page 46) is "to review the intelligence activities of the government, and assist the Director in initiating measures of coordination for recommendation to the National

ENCLOSURE 4

79

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT

Security Council". The report recommends that (page 63) "ICAPS should be reconstituted as a staff responsible only to the Director of CIA." This is not understood since ICAPS is now considered responsible only to the Director of CIA. The original concept of ICAPS was that it should act as a staff for the IAC but this has not been carried out in practice. The original concept is considered preferable to the present arrangement which should be changed as indicated below.

The following recommendations regarding ICAPS are submitted:

1. Redesignate ICAPS as the "Coordinating Staff" under the IAC (ICC).
2. Prepare a procedure for this staff containing the following provisions:
 - (a) The ICAPS (CS) shall be composed of members appointed by the member agencies of the IAC (ICC). A representative appointed by the Director of the CIA shall be the Chairman.
 - (b) ICAPS (CS) shall: (1) keep under continuous review the status of coordination among the various intelligence agencies and make recommendations to the IAC (ICC) for improvement therein; (2) maintain close liaison with member agencies of the IAC (ICC) and other

ENCLOSURE 1

87

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480/

agencies of the government concerned with the National Security with a view to establishing most effective collection of essential information, determining their intelligence needs and insuring an effective interdepartmental dissemination of intelligence; (3) perform such staff functions as the IAC (ICC) may assign, including initial drafts of proposals for the consideration of the IAC (ICC) and periodic checks to insure proper implementation of intelligence directives under the cognisance of the IAC (ICC); (4) determination of "Common Services" which can be best performed by the CIA.

In other words, the ICAPS (CS) relationship to the IAC (ICC) should approximate that of the Joint Intelligence Group to the Joint Intelligence Committee, with respect to matters of policy and procedures. Approval of the above recommendations should be followed by a written charter for ICAPS (CS).

D. The Central Intelligence Agency

UNCLASSIFIED

2102

UNCLASSIFIED

The report states (page 136) that "while we

INT 450/8

recognize that he (the Director) may be either civilian or military, we have reached the conclusion that he should be a civilian" unless (page 137) "he should resign from active military duty and thereafter work as a civilian". The report implies that a Director drawn from the military would be either (a) less competent or (b) less permanent than a civilian. As to (a), the most competent individual, civilian or military, who is willing to make the assignment a career should be appointed. There are many experienced and competent officers in the Military Establishment and no legal bar to their appointment is recommended. The loyalty, patriotism, and maturity of judgment of military officers in the upper ranks has been thoroughly tested. With one possible exception, all successful foreign secret services are presently headed by military officers and have been for many years. As to (b), it is probable that even greater difficulty would be encountered in obtaining permanency of tenure with a civilian than with a military officer. Very few really outstanding civilians in this field have been persuaded to remain in government service indefinitely. It is believed

ENCLOSURE (A)

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480/9

that the intent of the report is that a Service man assigned as the Director of Central Intelligence should "retire" rather than "resign" as resignation would result in the loss of retirement benefits. An officer's equity in future retired pay should be protected by suitable wording in any legislation making retirement mandatory. It is suggested that an officer from the services assigned this duty in the future undergo a trial period of approximately six months. His assignment should then be made permanent to, say, age 60, provided (1) the National Security Council is convinced of his competence, (2) the officer desires the assignment, and (3) he agrees to retire.

* * * * *

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
Proposed Revision of

INT 480A/1

copy

NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL INTELLIGENCE DIRECTIVE NO. 1
COORDINATION AND ADVISORY RESPONSIBILITIES AND FUNCTIONS

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 102 of the National Security Act of 1947, and for the purposes enunciated in paragraphs (d) and (e) thereof, the National Security Council hereby authorizes and directs that:

1. To maintain the relationship essential to coordination between the Central Intelligence Agency and the intelligence organizations, an Intelligence Coordinating Committee consisting of the respective intelligence chiefs from the Departments of State, Army, Navy, and Air Force and from the Joint Staff (JCS), and the Atomic Energy Commission, or their representatives, shall be established to make recommendations to the National Security Council for the coordination of such intelligence activities of the departments and agencies of the government as relate to the National Security. The Director of the Central Intelligence Agency shall be the Chairman thereof and he shall invite the chief, or his representative, of any other intelligence agency having functions related to the national security to sit with the Intelligence Coordinating Committee whenever matters within the purview of his agency are to be discussed. The Intelligence Coordinating Committee shall establish its own procedures, including procedures for the coordination and preparation of national intelligence estimates in both routine and in crisis situations.

- 1 -

Enclosure (5)
16 of 20

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480A/E

12

2. Coordination of intelligence activities should be designed primarily to strengthen the overall governmental intelligence structure. Primary departmental requirements shall be recognized and shall receive the cooperation and support of all other intelligence agencies.

a. Recommendations of the Director of Central Intelligence and of the Intelligence Coordinating Committee shall be forwarded to the National Security Council by the chairman of that Committee. These recommendations shall indicate the concurrence or nonconcurrence of the members of the ICC and shall contain the views of the dissenting members set forth in full. When unanimity is not obtained among the Department Heads of the National Military Establishment, the Chairman shall refer the problem to the Secretary of Defense before presenting it to the National Security Council. The foregoing procedure shall also be followed by the Director of Central Intelligence in forwarding recommendations or in giving advice to the National Security Council.

b. Recommendations of the Director of Central Intelligence, or of the Intelligence Coordinating Committee, shall, when approved by the National Security Council, issue as Council Directives to the originator. The respective intelligence chiefs shall be responsible for insuring that such orders and directives, when applicable, are implemented within their intelligence organizations.

Enclosure (2)

17 of 20

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480A/3

13

2. The Intelligence Coordinating Committee shall act for the National Security Council to insure full and proper implementation of Council Intelligence Directives by issuing such supplementary ICC directives as may be required. Such implementing directives in which the Intelligence Coordinating Committee concurs unanimously shall be issued by the Chairman thereof, and shall be implemented within the departments as provided in paragraph b. Where disagreement arises between members of the Intelligence Coordinating Committee over such directives, the proposed directive shall be forwarded to the National Security Council for decision as provided in paragraph a.

3. The Director of Central Intelligence shall produce intelligence relating to the national security, hereafter referred to as national intelligence. In so far as practicable, he shall not duplicate the intelligence activities and research of the various departments and agencies but shall make use of existing intelligence facilities and shall utilize departmental intelligence for such production purposes. For definitions see NSCID No. 3.

4. The Director of Central Intelligence shall disseminate National Intelligence to the President, to members of the National Security Council, to the Intelligence Chiefs of the IAC agencies, and to such governmental departments and agencies as the National Security Council from time to time may designate. Intelligence so disseminated shall be officially concurred in by the intelligence

Enclosure (8)

18 of 20

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

INT 480A/4

14

agencies or shall carry an agreed statement of substantial dissent.

5. When Security Regulations of the originating agency permit, the Director of Central Intelligence shall disseminate to the Federal Bureau of Investigation and other departments or agencies intelligence or intelligence information which he may possess when he deems such dissemination appropriate to their functions relating to the national security.

6. The Director of Central Intelligence shall perform for the benefit of the existing intelligence agencies such services of common concern to these agencies as the National Security Council determines can be more efficiently accomplished centrally.

7. The intelligence organizations in each of the departments and agencies shall maintain with the Central Intelligence Agency and with each other, as appropriate to their respective responsibilities, a continuing interchange of intelligence information and intelligence available to them.

8. The intelligence files in each intelligence organization, including the CIA, shall be made available under security regulations of the department or agency concerned to the others for consultation.

9. The intelligence organizations within the limits of their capabilities shall provide, or procure, such intelligence as may

Enclosure (8)

198/20

UNCLASSIFIED

2109

UNCLASSIFIED

IN 480 A

be requested by the Director of Central Intelligence or by one of the other departments or agencies.

10. The Director of Central Intelligence shall make arrangements with the respective departments and agencies to assign to the Central Intelligence Agency such experienced and qualified officers and members as may be of advantage for advisory, operational, or other purposes, in addition to such personnel as the Director of Central Intelligence may directly employ. In each case, such departmental personnel will be subject to the necessary personnel procedures of each department.

11. The provisions of this directive shall not be construed as an abrogation of any right or responsibility conferred upon any individual or organization by duly constituted authority.

5 NOTE: If this directive is approved DCI Directive 1/1 will require revision to conform.

Enclosure (8)

30 of 30

UNCLASSIFIED